

Short note on second-order gauge-invariant cosmological perturbation theory

Kouji Nakamura¹

*Department of Astronomical Science, the Graduate University for Advanced Studies, 2-21-1, Osawa,
Mitaka, Tokyo 181-8588, Japan*

Abstract

The second order perturbations in Friedmann-Robertson-Walker universe filled with a perfect fluid are completely formulated in the gauge invariant manner without any gauge fixing. All components of the Einstein equations are derived neglecting the first order vector and tensor modes. These equations imply that the tensor and the vector mode of the second order metric perturbations may be generated by the non-linear effects of the Einstein equations from the first order density perturbations.

Recently, the first order approximation of the early universe from a homogeneous isotropic one is revealed by the observation of the CMB by Wilkinson Microwave Anisotropy Probe (WMAP)[1] and is suggested that fluctuations in the early universe are adiabatic and Gaussian at least in the first order approximation. One of the next theoretical tasks is to clarify the accuracy of these results, for example, through the non-Gaussianity. To do this, the second order cosmological perturbation theory is necessary.

In this article, we show the gauge invariant formulation of the general relativistic second order cosmological perturbations on the background Friedmann-Robertson-Walker (FRW) universe $\mathcal{M}_0$ filled with the perfect fluid whose metric is given by

$$g_{ab} = a^2(\eta) \left(-(d\eta)_a (d\eta)_b + \gamma_{ij} (dx^i)_a (dx^j)_b \right), \quad (1)$$

where γ_{ij} is the metric on maximally symmetric three space. The details of our formulation is given in Refs.[2].

The gauge transformation rules for the variable Q , which is expanded as $Q_\lambda = Q_0 + \lambda^{(1)}Q + \frac{1}{2}\lambda^{(2)}Q$, are given by

$$\begin{aligned} {}^{(1)}_{\mathcal{Y}}Q - {}^{(1)}_{\mathcal{X}}Q &= \mathcal{L}_{\xi_{(1)}} Q_0, & {}^{(2)}_{\mathcal{Y}}Q - {}^{(2)}_{\mathcal{X}}Q &= 2\mathcal{L}_{\xi_{(1)}} {}^{(1)}_{\mathcal{X}}Q + \left\{ \mathcal{L}_{\xi_{(2)}} + \mathcal{L}_{\xi_{(1)}}^2 \right\} Q_0, \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

where $\mathcal{X}$ and $\mathcal{Y}$ represent two different gauge choices, $\xi_{(1)}^a$ and $\xi_{(2)}^a$ are generators of the first and the second order gauge transformations, respectively.

The metric $\bar{g}_{ab}$ on the physical spacetime $\mathcal{M}_\lambda$ is expanded as $\bar{g}_{ab} = g_{ab} + \lambda h_{ab} + \frac{\lambda^2}{2} l_{ab}$. We decompose the components of the first order metric perturbation h_{ab} into the three sets of variables $\{h_{\eta\eta}, h_{(VL)}, h_{(L)}, h_{TL}\}$, $\{h_{(V)i}, h_{(TV)_i}\}$, and $h_{(TT)ij}$, which are defined by

$$h_{\eta i} =: D_i h_{(VL)} + h_{(V)i}, \quad h_{ij} =: a^2 h_{(L)} \gamma_{ij} + a^2 h_{(T)ij}, \quad D^i h_{(V)i} = 0, \quad \gamma^{ij} h_{(T)ij} = 0, \quad (3)$$

$$h_{(T)ij} =: \left(D_i D_j - \frac{1}{3} \gamma_{ij} \Delta \right) h_{(TL)} + 2D_{(i} h_{(TV)j)} + h_{(TT)ij}, \quad D^i h_{(TV)i} = 0, \quad D^i h_{(TT)ij} = 0. \quad (4)$$

Inspecting gauge transformation rules (2), we define a vector field X_a by

$$X_a := X_\eta (d\eta)_a + X_i (dx^i)_a, \quad X_\eta := h_{(VL)} - \frac{1}{2} a^2 \partial_\tau h_{(TL)}, \quad X_i := a^2 \left(h_{(TV)i} + \frac{1}{2} D_i h_{(TL)} \right), \quad (5)$$

where X_a is transformed as ${}_{\mathcal{Y}}X_a - {}_{\mathcal{X}}X_a = \xi_{(1)a}$ under the gauge transformation (2). We can also define the gauge invariant variables for the linear order metric perturbation by

$$\mathcal{H}_{ab} = -2a^2 {}^{(1)}_{\Phi} (d\eta)_a (d\eta)_b + 2a^2 {}^{(1)}_{\nu_i} (d\eta)_{(a} (dx^i)_{b)} + a^2 \left(-2 {}^{(1)}_{\Psi} \gamma_{ij} + {}^{(1)}_{\chi_{ij}} \right) (dx^i)_a (dx^j)_b, \quad (6)$$

¹E-mail:kouchan@th.nao.ac.jp

where $D^i \overset{(1)}{\nu}_i = \overset{(1)}{\chi}_{[ij]} = \overset{(1)}{\chi}^i_{i} = D^i \overset{(1)}{\chi}_{ij} = 0$. In the cosmological perturbations[3], $\{\overset{(1)}{\Phi}, \overset{(1)}{\Psi}\}$, $\overset{(1)}{\nu}_i$, $\overset{(1)}{\chi}_{ij}$ are called the scalar, vector, and tensor modes, respectively. In terms of the variables $\mathcal{H}_{ab}$ and X_a , the original first order metric perturbation h_{ab} is given by

$$h_{ab} =: \mathcal{H}_{ab} + \mathcal{L}_X g_{ab}. \quad (7)$$

Since the scalar mode dominates in the early universe, we assume that $\overset{(1)}{\nu}_i = \overset{(1)}{\chi}_{ij} = 0$ in this article.

As shown in Ref.[2], through the above variables X_a and h_{ab} , the second order metric perturbation l_{ab} is decomposed as

$$l_{ab} =: \mathcal{L}_{ab} + 2\mathcal{L}_X h_{ab} + (\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2) g_{ab}. \quad (8)$$

The variables $\mathcal{L}_{ab}$ and Y^a are the gauge invariant and variant parts of l_{ab} , respectively. The vector field Y_a is transformed as $\overset{(2)}{Y}_a - \mathcal{L} X_a = \xi_{(2)}^a + [\xi_{(1)}, X]^a$ under the gauge transformations (2). The components of $\mathcal{L}_{ab}$ are given by

$$\mathcal{L}_{ab} = -2a^2 \overset{(2)}{\Phi} (d\eta)_a (d\eta)_b + 2a^2 \overset{(2)}{\nu}_i (d\eta)_{(a} (dx^i)_{b)} + a^2 \left(-2 \overset{(2)}{\Psi} \gamma_{ij} + \overset{(2)}{\chi}_{ij} \right) (dx^i)_a (dx^j)_b, \quad (9)$$

where $D^i \overset{(2)}{\nu}_i = \overset{(2)}{\chi}_{[ij]} = \overset{(2)}{\chi}^i_{i} = D^i \overset{(2)}{\chi}_{ij} = 0$.

As shown in Ref.[2], by using the above variables X_a and Y_a , we can find the gauge invariant variables for the perturbations of an arbitrary field as

$$\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{Q}} := \overset{(1)}{Q} - \mathcal{L}_X Q_0, \quad \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{Q}} := \overset{(2)}{Q} - 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{Q} - \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} Q_0. \quad (10)$$

As the matter contents, in this article, we consider the perfect fluid whose energy-momentum tensor is given by $\bar{T}_a^{b} = (\bar{\epsilon} + \bar{p}) \bar{u}_a \bar{u}^b + \bar{p} \delta_a^{b}$. We expand these fluid components $\bar{\epsilon}$, $\bar{p}$, and $\bar{u}_a$ as

$$\bar{\epsilon} = \epsilon + \lambda \overset{(1)}{\epsilon} + \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2 \overset{(2)}{\epsilon}, \quad \bar{p} = p + \lambda \overset{(1)}{p} + \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2 \overset{(2)}{p}, \quad \bar{u}_a = u_a + \lambda \overset{(1)}{u}_a + \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2 \overset{(2)}{u}_a p. \quad (11)$$

Following the definitions (10), we easily obtain the corresponding gauge invariant variables for these perturbations of the fluid components:

$$\begin{aligned} \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{E}} &:= \overset{(1)}{\epsilon} - \mathcal{L}_X \epsilon, & \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{P}} &:= \overset{(1)}{p} - \mathcal{L}_X p, & \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{U}}_a &:= \overset{(1)}{u}_a - \mathcal{L}_X u_a, & \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{E}} &:= \overset{(2)}{\epsilon} - 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{\epsilon} - \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} \epsilon, \\ \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{P}} &:= \overset{(2)}{p} - 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{p} - \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} p, & \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{U}}_a &:= \overset{(2)}{u}_a - 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{u}_a - \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} u_a. \end{aligned}$$

Through $\bar{g}^{ab} \bar{u}_a \bar{u}_b = g^{ab} u_a u_b = -1$ and neglecting the rotational part in $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{U}}_a$, the components of $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{U}}_a$ are given by $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{U}}_a = -a \overset{(1)}{\Phi} (d\eta)_a + a D_i \overset{(1)}{v}^i (dx^i)_a$.

We also expand the Einstein tensor as $\bar{G}_a^{b} = G_a^{b} + \lambda \overset{(1)}{G}_a^{b} + \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2 \overset{(2)}{G}_a^{b}$. From Eqs.(7) and (8), each order perturbation of the Einstein tensor is given by

$$\overset{(1)}{G}_a^{b} = \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{H}] + \mathcal{L}_X G_a^{b}, \quad \overset{(2)}{G}_a^{b} = \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{L}] + \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{H}, \mathcal{H}] + 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{G}_a^{b} + \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} G_a^{b} \quad (12)$$

as expected from Eqs. (10). Here, $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{H}]$ and $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{L}] + \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{G}}_a^{b} [\mathcal{H}, \mathcal{H}]$ are gauge invariant parts of the first and the second order perturbations of the Einstein tensor, respectively. On the other hand, the energy momentum tensor of the perfect fluid is also expanded as $\bar{T}_a^{b} = T_a^{b} + \lambda \overset{(1)}{T}_a^{b} + \frac{1}{2} \lambda^2 \overset{(2)}{T}_a^{b}$ and $\overset{(1)}{T}_a^{b}$ and $\overset{(2)}{T}_a^{b}$ are also given in the form

$$\overset{(1)}{T}_a^{b} = \overset{(1)}{\mathcal{T}}_a^{b} + \mathcal{L}_X T_a^{b}, \quad \overset{(2)}{T}_a^{b} = \overset{(2)}{\mathcal{T}}_a^{b} + 2\mathcal{L}_X \overset{(1)}{T}_a^{b} + \{\mathcal{L}_Y - \mathcal{L}_X^2\} T_a^{b} \quad (13)$$

through the definitions (12) of the gauge invariant variables of the fluid components. Here, $\overset{(1)}{\mathcal{T}}_a^{b}$ and $\overset{(2)}{\mathcal{T}}_a^{b}$ are gauge invariant part of the first and the second order perturbation of the energy momentum

tensor, respectively. Then, the first and the second order perturbations of the Einstein equation are necessarily given in term of gauge invariant variables:

$$^{(1)}\mathcal{G}_a{}^b[\mathcal{H}] = 8\pi G^{(1)}\mathcal{T}_a{}^b, \quad ^{(1)}\mathcal{G}_a{}^b[\mathcal{L}] + ^{(2)}\mathcal{G}_a{}^b[\mathcal{H}, \mathcal{H}] = 8\pi G^{(2)}\mathcal{T}_a{}^b. \quad (14)$$

The traceless scalar part of the spatial component of the first equation in Eq.(14) yields $\Psi = \Phi$, and the other components of Eq. (14) give well-known equations[3].

Since we neglect the first order vector and tensor modes, $\mathcal{U}_a$ is given by

$$\mathcal{U}_a^{(2)} = -a \left(\left(\frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right)^2 - D_i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} D^i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} - \frac{^{(2)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right) (d\eta)_a + a \left(D_i \frac{^{(2)}v}{v} + \mathcal{V}_i^{(2)} \right) (dx^i)_a, \quad (15)$$

where $D^i \mathcal{V}_i^{(2)} = 0$. All components of the second equation in Eq. (14) are summarized as follows: As the scalar parts, we have

$$4\pi G a^2 \mathcal{E}^{(2)} = (-3\mathcal{H}\partial_\eta + \Delta + 3K - 3\mathcal{H}^2) \frac{^{(2)}\Phi}{\Phi} - \Gamma_0 + \frac{3}{2} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right) - \frac{9}{2} \mathcal{H} \partial_\eta (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right), \quad (16)$$

$$8\pi G a^2 (\epsilon + p) D_i \frac{^{(2)}v}{v} = -2\partial_\eta D_i \frac{^{(2)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 2\mathcal{H} D_i \frac{^{(2)}\Phi}{\Phi} + D_i \Delta^{-1} D^k \Gamma_k{}^k - 3\partial_\eta D_i (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right), \quad (17)$$

$$4\pi G a^2 \mathcal{P}^{(2)} = (\partial_\eta^2 + 3\mathcal{H}\partial_\eta - K + 2\partial_\eta \mathcal{H} + \mathcal{H}^2) \frac{^{(2)}\Phi}{\Phi} - \frac{1}{2} \Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j + \frac{3}{2} (\partial_\eta^2 + 2\mathcal{H}\partial_\eta) (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right), \quad (18)$$

$$\Psi - \Phi = \frac{3}{2} (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i{}^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right). \quad (19)$$

where $\mathcal{H} = \partial_\eta a/a$ and

$$\begin{aligned} \Gamma_0 &:= 8\pi G a^2 (\epsilon + p) D^i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} D_i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} - 3D_k \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D^k \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 3 \left(\partial_\eta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right)^2 - 8 \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \Delta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 12 (K + \mathcal{H}^2) \left(\frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right)^2, \\ \Gamma_i &:= -16\pi G a^2 \left(\mathcal{E} + \mathcal{P} \right) D_i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} + 12\mathcal{H} \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D_i \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 4 \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \partial_\eta D_i \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 4\partial_\eta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D_i \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi}, \\ \Gamma_i{}^j &:= 16\pi G a^2 (\epsilon + p) D_i \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} D^j \frac{^{(1)}v}{v} - 4D_i \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D^j \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} - 8 \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D_i D^j \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \\ &\quad + 2 \left(3D_k \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} D^k \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} + 4 \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \Delta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} + \left(\partial_\eta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right)^2 + 4 (2\partial_\eta \mathcal{H} + K + \mathcal{H}^2) \left(\frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right)^2 + 8\mathcal{H} \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \partial_\eta \frac{^{(1)}\Phi}{\Phi} \right) \gamma_i{}^j. \end{aligned} \quad (20)$$

As the vector parts, we have

$$8\pi G a^2 (\epsilon + p) \mathcal{V}_i^{(2)} = \frac{1}{2} (\Delta + 2K) \mathcal{V}_i^{(2)} + (\Gamma_i - D_i \Delta^{-1} D^k \Gamma_k{}^k), \quad (21)$$

$$\partial_\eta \left(a^2 \mathcal{V}_i^{(2)} \right) = 2a^2 (\Delta + 2K)^{-1} \{ D_i \Delta^{-1} D^k D_l \Gamma_k{}^l - D_k \Gamma_i{}^k \}. \quad (22)$$

As the tensor parts, we have the evolution equation of $\chi_{ij}^{(2)}$

$$\begin{aligned} &(\partial_\eta^2 + 2\mathcal{H}\partial_\eta + 2K - \Delta) \chi_{ij}^{(2)} \\ &= 2\Gamma_{ij} - \frac{2}{3} \gamma_{ij} \Gamma_k{}^k - 3 \left(D_i D_j - \frac{1}{3} \gamma_{ij} \Delta \right) (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^k D_l \Gamma_k{}^l - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k{}^k \right) \\ &\quad + 4 \left(D_{(i} (\Delta + 2K)^{-1} D_{j)} \Delta^{-1} D^l D_k \Gamma_l{}^k - D_{(i} (\Delta + 2K)^{-1} D^k \Gamma_{j)k} \right), \end{aligned} \quad (23)$$

Equations (22) and (23) imply that the second order vector and tensor modes may be generated due to the scalar-scalar mode coupling of the first order perturbation.

Further, the equations (16) and (19) are reduced to the single equation for $\Phi^{(2)}$

$$\begin{aligned} & (\partial_\eta^2 + 3\mathcal{H}(1 + c_s^2)\partial_\eta - c_s^2\Delta + 2\partial_\eta\mathcal{H} + (1 + 3c_s^2)(\mathcal{H}^2 - K)) \Phi^{(2)} \\ = & 4\pi G a^2 \left\{ \tau \frac{(2)}{\mathcal{S}} + \frac{\partial c_s^2}{\partial \epsilon} \left(\frac{(1)}{\mathcal{E}} \right)^2 + 2 \frac{\partial c_s^2}{\partial S} \frac{(1)(1)}{\mathcal{E} \mathcal{S}} + \frac{\partial \tau}{\partial S} \left(\frac{(1)}{\mathcal{S}} \right)^2 \right\} + \frac{3}{2} \left(c_s^2 + \frac{1}{3} \right) \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k^k \right) \\ & - c_s^2 \Gamma_0 + \frac{1}{6} \Gamma_k^k - \frac{3}{2} (\partial_\eta^2 + (2 + 3c_s^2) \mathcal{H} \partial_\eta) (\Delta + 3K)^{-1} \left(\Delta^{-1} D^i D_j \Gamma_i^j - \frac{1}{3} \Gamma_k^k \right). \end{aligned} \quad (24)$$

Here, we have used the second order perturbation of the equation of state for the fluid components

$$\frac{(2)}{\mathcal{P}} = c_s^2 \frac{(2)}{\mathcal{E}} + \tau \frac{(2)}{\mathcal{S}} + \frac{\partial c_s^2}{\partial \epsilon} \frac{(1)^2}{\mathcal{E}^2} + 2 \frac{\partial c_s^2}{\partial S} \frac{(1)(1)}{\mathcal{E} \mathcal{S}} + \frac{\partial \tau}{\partial S} \frac{(1)^2}{\mathcal{S}^2}, \quad (25)$$

where $\mathcal{S}^{(1)}$ and $\mathcal{S}^{(2)}$ are the gauge invariant entropy perturbation of the first and second order, respectively, we denoted that $c_s^2 := \partial \bar{p} / \partial \bar{\epsilon}$ and $\tau := \partial \bar{p} / \partial \bar{S}$. The equation (24) will be useful to discuss non-linear effects in the CMB physics[4]. We also derive the similar equations in the case where the matter content of the universe is a single scalar field[2].

Now, we are developing our formulation to the case in which the first order vector and tensor modes are not negligible. In some inflationary scenario, the tensor mode are also generated by the quantum fluctuations. This extension is necessary to clarify the evolution of the second order perturbation in the existence of the first order tensor mode. Further, to apply this formulation to clarify the non-linear effects in CMB physics[4], we have to extend our formulation to multi-field system and the Einstein Boltzmann system. This extension of our formulation is one of our future works.

Moreover, the rotational part of the fluid velocity in Eqs. (21) of the vector mode is also important in the early universe because this part of the fluid velocity is related to the generation of the magnetic field in the early universe[5]. The generation of the tensor mode by Eq. (23) is also interesting, since this is one of the generation process of gravitational waves. We have already known that the fluctuations of the scalar mode exist in the early universe from the anisotropy of the CMB[6]. Hence, the generation of the vector mode and tensor mode due to the second order perturbation will give the lower limit of these modes in the early universe.

References

- [1] C.L. Bennett et al., *Astrophys. J. Suppl.* **148**, 1 (2003).
- [2] K. Nakamura, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* **110**, 723 (2003); *ibid.* **113**, 481 (2005); K. Nakamura, *Phys. Rev. D* **74**, 101301; K. Nakamura, *Prog. Theor. Phys.* **117** (2007), in press [arXiv:gr-qc/0605108].
- [3] J. M. Bardeen, *Phys. Rev. D* **22** (1980), 1882; H. Kodama and M. Sasaki, *Prog. Theor. Phys. Suppl.* No.78, 1 (1984); V. F. Mukhanov, H. A. Feldman and R. H. Brandenberger, *Phys. Rep.* **215**, 203 (1992).
- [4] N. Bartolo, S. Matarrese and A. Riotto, *JCAP* **0401**, 003 (2004); N. Bartolo, S. Matarrese and A. Riotto, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **93** (2004), 231301; N. Bartolo, E. Komatsu, S. Matarrese and A. Riotto, *Phys. Rept.* **402**, 103 (2004); N. Bartolo, S. Matarrese, and A. Riotto, arXiv:astro-ph/0512481.
- [5] S. Matarrese, S. Mollerach, A. Notari, and A. Riotto, *Phys. Rev. D* **71** (2005), 043502; K. Takahashi, K. Ichiki, H. Ohno, and H. Hanayama, *Phys. Rev. Lett.* **95** (2005), 121301.
- [6] S. Mollerach, D. Harari, and S. Matarrese, *Phys. Rev. D* **69** (2004), 063002; K.N. Ananda, C. Clarkson, and D. Wands, preprint [arXiv:gr-qc/0612013].